

MINUTES: DWIGHT D. EISENHOWER MEMORIAL COMMISSION MEETING

APPROVED BY COMMISSIONERS APRIL 29, 2015

June 19, 2013: Room 385, Russell Senate Office Building, Washington,
D.C.

Commissioners in Attendance:

Rocco C. Siciliano, Chairman
Senator Pat Roberts
Senator Jerry Moran
Representative Sanford Bishop
Representative Mike Simpson
Alfred Geduldig
Susan Banes Harris

Commissioners Absent:

Senator Jack Reed
Representative Mac Thornberry

Commissioners' Staff:

Jesse Haladay (Rep. Mike Thompson)
Jonathan Halpern (Rep. Sanford Bishop)
Lindsay Slater (Rep. Simpson)
Missy Small (Rep. Simpson)
Michael Seeds (Rep. Thornberry)
Nathan Heiman (Sen. Jerry Moran)
Ginny James (Sen. Reed)
Jackie Cottrell (Sen. Roberts)
Lisa Gagnon (Sen. Roberts)
Amber Sechrist (Sen. Roberts)

EMC:

Chris Cimko
Albert Cramer
Andrew Demetriou
Asia Edwards
Dan Feil
Louis Galambos
Shannon Honl
Joyce Jacobson
Pete Jordan
Eden Kanowitz
Tom Lorentzen
Laura Mackiewicz
Carl Reddel
Annemarie Spadafore
Rick Striner
Victoria Tigwell

Advisory Committee:

Leonard Boswell
Harold Burson
Gen. P.X. Kelley, USMC (Ret.)
Tom Korologos
Ralph Mecham
Paul O'Day
Gil Robinson
John Shlaes

Gilbane:

Carol Moore

GSA:

Tyrone Anderson
Matt Conrad
John Peters
Chris Prescott
Lesly Wilson
Mina Wright

AECOM:

Greg Bordinowski
Jon Miller
Claire Sale

NPS:

Peter May
Glen DeMarr

Gehry Partners:

John Bowers
Frank Gehry
Sevak Karabachian
Meaghan Lloyd
Kristin Ragins
Brian Zamora

K & L Gates:

Andy Cook

NCPC:

Christine Saum

Media:

Carolyn Kaster, AP Photo
Julia Langley, DCist
Sean Lengell, Washington Examiner
Lonnae O'Neal Parker, Washington Post
Maria Recio, McClatchy
Photographer, McClatchy
Meredith Somers, Washington Times

Photographer, Washington Times
Brett Zongker, AP

OSL
Nikki Day
Rob Hartman
Annie Kasper

Others present:
Howard Bauleke
Kevin Cosgriff
Melanie Foster
Jesse Haladay
Casey Hammond
Eric London
Howard Segermark
Justin Shubow
Alex Siciliano
Stephen Siciliano
Stuart Siciliano
Garth Spencer
Jim Streeter

Call to Order and Introductory Remarks

Chairman Siciliano called the meeting to order at 2:45 p.m. He observed that this is the first Eisenhower Memorial Commission (EMC) meeting in over a year, and that since the last meeting the EMC has suffered a terrible loss in the passing of Senator Daniel Inouye, Vice Chairman of the EMC, who died in December 2012. Chairman Siciliano observed that the late senator was an extraordinary person whose salient qualities were good judgment, impeccable manners, and responsiveness to others. Mr. Siciliano said in light of his own ill health in recent months, Senator Pat Roberts has assisted him with some of the duties of the chairmanship. Mr. Siciliano then introduced the new Chairman of the EMC Advisory Committee, General P. X. Kelley, USMC (Ret.).

Executive Director Carl Reddel continued the introduction, observing that Gen. Kelley has served as Commandant of the U.S. Marine Corps and Chairman of the United States Battle Monuments Commission, which oversaw the design and construction of the National World War II Memorial and the Korean War Memorial. Gen. Reddel invited Gen. Kelley to share some remarks.

Gen. Kelley said that he was a disciple and student of the late Carter Brown, chair of the Commission of Fine Arts, and that together they worked to create the World War II and Korean War Memorials. He shared several anecdotes concerning his service in the Marine Corps,

including a recent stay at the National Naval Medical Center for sciatica surgery, in the course of which he insisted on recuperating with young wounded Marines who had just returned from tours of duty in Iraq and Afghanistan. Turning to the tasks confronting the EMC, Gen. Kelley stated that in building any monument, three paramount considerations must prevail: accurate information, a quality index, and leadership. He recalled that when he retired from the Marine Corps, President George H. W. Bush asked him what he would like to do, and, recalling his father's service during World War II, in which he gave his life, he chose the American Battle Monuments Commission so that he could help oversee the creation of the World War II Memorial. Gen. Kelley stated that the quality of the Gehry design for the Dwight D. Eisenhower Memorial is spectacular and that young people in particular will be moved by its message. He recalled that in a European tour on behalf of the Marine Corps he found that Ike was universally regarded as the savior of Europe and perhaps mankind.

Chairman Siciliano welcomed former EMC Commissioner Leonard Boswell, who will now serve as Vice Chairman of the EMC Advisory Committee. Mr. Boswell thanked Gen. Kelley for his willingness to serve as Advisory Committee Chairman. He said that he had been delighted to serve on the EMC. He also observed that he had taken his time to decide on the merits of the Gehry design but that he came to sense its power and promise, especially its message that out of the middle of the country a young man went forth to do great things, and that many young children who are coming and going from museums near the Eisenhower Memorial will see that the chance to do the right thing can be theirs as well. He concluded by saying that the design was a great concept and that the EMC needs to get the job done and get it built.

Chairman Siciliano invited Senator Roberts to share some remarks.

Senator Roberts commented that he had worked for a dozen years to see Ike memorialized, and spent countless hours reviewing design modifications. He observed that Ike brought an end to World War II and gave the United States eight years of peace and prosperity during his tenure in the presidency. There were no major national crises during Ike's years in the White House because Eisenhower *prevented* crises. His legacy spans many institutions, innovations, and accomplishments. And there is a new urgency in the memorialization effort due to the passing of Senator Inouye, a World War II hero in his own right. The "greatest generation" wants to see its own general and leader memorialized, and the Commission must press forward, like Marines, who always advance and never retreat. Senator Roberts said that he supported the Gehry design from the beginning, that it brings

Kansas and the heartland and small-town America to the National Mall, that it presents the themes of American opportunity and the American role in saving the world from totalitarian disaster. He thanked the EMC staff for its deliberative and responsible work. He stated that the Eisenhower Memorial must not be a monument for any single group of people and that it is no easy task to design a memorial to any president. He observed that he had met President Eisenhower and that it was an overwhelming experience. He explained that he had been requested to serve as an "honest broker" in mediating relations with the Eisenhower family, that he had tried hard to reach an accord, but remaining differences of opinion should not become an obstacle because it would be a tragedy if the Eisenhower Memorial is not built.

Approval of Minutes of May 15, 2012

Chairman Siciliano requested the Commission to approve the minutes for the EMC meeting of May 15, 2012. Senator Roberts moved approval and Senator Moran and Ms. Harris seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

Presentation by Frank Gehry and Gehry Partners

Chairman Siciliano invited Frank Gehry to address the Commission.

Mr. Gehry said that he wished to reflect upon the genesis of the memorial design: Ike's famous statement that "I come from the very heart of America." From humble beginnings Ike rose to be a great general and a great president, and Mr. Gehry stated that he found himself quite humbled after spending time with Ike's words and reflecting on his legacy. Mr. Gehry stated that the design in its current form is very close to the original design in the competition model, but the newest and most refined version of the design reflects the recent contributions from historians and sculptors. He said that Ike's overall achievement comprised a harmonious balance between his leadership ability and his modest demeanor and that capturing this balance in design is a difficult challenge. The achievement of Eisenhower in harmonizing these qualities is what empowered him to achieve many victories in the face of daunting obstacles, and that the message his achievement conveys is nothing less than the promise of America, the history and future of America. Each visitor to the memorial should be inspired by that story, a story that started in Abilene, where Ike's identity was formed. Abilene is therefore the backdrop to the memorial, and the tapestries that depict it set the stage for the memorial's core, in which his words and deeds will be presented. The military leadership will be visually exemplified by imagery representing the D-Day landings at Normandy and the

presidential leadership will be presented through an image of Ike signing the first civil rights act to pass Congress since Reconstruction. Ike stood for equal access to the resources that make America great. Though he considered himself ordinary, his achievements were extraordinary. Mr. Gehry asked John Bowers of Gehry Partners to comment on the most recent revisions to the memorial design.

Mr. Bowers stated that the principal revisions to the memorial design in the past year consisted of the replacement of the presidential image of Eisenhower posing with a large globe (based upon a Yousuf Karsh photograph) with the image of Ike signing the Civil Rights Act of 1957, the combination of free-standing sculptural elements with bas-relief sculpture, and adjustments to the sculpted image of young Eisenhower, who is now depicted sitting casually on the memorial overlook wall; he is represented as a teenager dreaming about his future, a representation that relates to the Department of Education located alongside it. Mr. Bowers stated that the art in the metal tapestry has been further developed and that technical advances in the material studies relating to the tapestries will permit Gehry Partners to submit positive results to NCPC in early July in anticipation of a possible approval hearing in September.

Representative Simpson requested permission to speak. He stated that no one could disagree with Gen. Kelley or Sen. Roberts in regard to their estimation of Dwight D. Eisenhower, but that disagreements on the memorial design continued to exist. He informed the Commission that he had been requested by Susan and Anne Eisenhower to read a letter into the record on their behalf (copy attached). Representative Simpson closed by stating that the voices of Susan and Anne Eisenhower needed to be heard.

Chairman Siciliano replied. He said that this message from Susan and Anne Eisenhower comes as no surprise. He observed that few people can know the extent to which the Commission has worked with the Eisenhower family, and that, while the family deserves to be heard, the family does not have to be obeyed. Chairman Siciliano stated for the record that for more than ten years David Eisenhower was a member of the Dwight D. Eisenhower Memorial Commission, and that the Commission's records make it very clear that there was never any attempt by the Commission to railroad the process or over-ride outside opinion. Mr. Siciliano stated that he always strove to make certain that the opinions of the Eisenhower granddaughters would be considered. He concluded by stating that the decision-making process of the Commission has been a fair process.

Approval of Design

Senator Moran asked if the next order of business was a motion to approve the Gehry design in its current form. Chairman Siciliano replied in the affirmative, while cautioning that ongoing changes and revisions will necessarily occur in the design approval process. Mr. Gehry observed that some of the recent changes had been made in response to objections raised by Susan Eisenhower, including the replacement of the Karsh image and additional development of the D-Day imagery.

Chairman Siciliano observed that it was very important for the commissioners to evaluate the version of design that was on display in the architectural models. He added that during his service chairing the campaign to build the Getty Museum in Los Angeles revisions to the design continued right down to the end. Senator Moran asked if there would be any further changes needing approval that Mr. Gehry could anticipate, and Mr. Gehry replied that only minor refinements to the sculptural elements were anticipated. Senator Moran reiterated Chairman Siciliano's point that the commissioners should be certain that the architectural models on display had been duly examined.

Commissioner Geduldig requested permission to speak. He stated that in the course of twelve years the Eisenhower family had been involved constantly in the Commission's work, not only due to David Eisenhower's membership on the Commission but also because of frequent input from the Eisenhower sisters, who have had their say not only in public meetings but in closed sessions of the Commission's deliberations as well. Mr. Geduldig stated that there has never been a lack of opportunity for members of the Eisenhower family to express their views, and that their comments have been reviewed carefully and objectively. He observed that the Eisenhower family constitutes merely one facet of the multi-faceted public constituency for this project, in addition to military experts, historians, and members of the general public who have contributed a wide range of input. He said that this memorial design is unlike any other because Ike was unlike any other president: he was born in the nineteenth century but his life served as a dynamic historical bridge through the twentieth century to the twenty first. He observed that Eisenhower the wartime leader was relatively easy to depict, whereas it was more difficult to depict his transition into the president who maintained peace, prosperity, and progress. Mr. Geduldig stated that, in his own opinion, Greco-Roman aesthetics as advocated by some of the critics of the Gehry design seemed incongruous and inappropriate in light of the nature of Ike's contributions to the modernizing of American life.

Special Counsel Demetriou, in response to Senator Moran's question, indicated that it was necessary for the Commission to adopt resolutions concerning the approval of the current design. He suggested the following resolutions for the Commission's consideration:

"RESOLVED, that the design concept presented to the Commission by Frank Gehry, incorporating elements added in response to comments since the approval of the initial design concept by the Commission in 2010, is endorsed by the Commission;

RESOLVED FURTHER, that the Commission Staff and Gehry Partners are authorized to make presentations of the endorsed design to the National Capital Planning Commission and the Commission of Fine Arts for their approval."

Senator Moran adopted these proposed resolutions as a motion to approve the design. Senator Roberts seconded the motion. The Commission approved the motion on a roll-call vote:

Chairman Siciliano	Aye
Senator Roberts	Aye
Senator Moran	Aye
Representative Bishop	Aye
Representative Simpson	Aye
Mr. Geduldig	Aye
Ms. Harris	Aye

H.R. 1126

Chairman Siciliano called the Commission's attention to the agenda item regarding H.R. 1126, legislation regarding the Commission introduced in the House of Representatives by Rep. Rob Bishop (R/Utah). Mr. Demetriou noted that discussion of this proposed legislation should be treated as an informational matter, not requiring any Commission action, and requested that Executive Director Reddel and staff member Annemarie Spadafore brief the Commission.

Ms. Spadafore informed that Commission that the legislation, after mark-up, had passed the subcommittee chaired by Rep. Rob Bishop. Gen. Reddel observed that the legislation, as amended, contained three principal items: (1) that the existing membership of the Dwight D. Eisenhower Memorial Commission be terminated and that new Commissioners should be appointed; (2) that the existing Executive Director and staff members of the Commissions should cease to be employed by the Commission thirty days after passage of the legislation; and (3) that the records of the Commission be retained by

GSA or the National Park Service until such time as a new Commission has been appointed.

Rep. Simpson observed that even if this legislation were passed by the House of Representatives, it might not come up for consideration in the Senate.

Approval of Quotations

Chairman Siciliano asked Prof. Louis Galambos, Chairman of the Eisenhower Quotations Committee, to report to the Commission. But since the Senatorial members of the Commission needed to depart for a vote in the Senate, the Chairman asked them to share any closing observations that they wished to make.

Senator Roberts stated that he had tried to serve as an honest broker with the Eisenhower family, that he had spent over fifty hours with family members and explored every possible option for changes to the Gehry design that might break the impasse, and that, while Mr. Gehry made changes that Susan and Anne Eisenhower recommended, the impasse remains. He observed that sometimes you can work things out and sometimes you can't, and in the latter case one must decide whether to move forward or not. Senator Roberts regrets this state of affairs but is convinced that the Commission must move forward.

Senator Moran thanked Senator Roberts for his tireless efforts to mediate the design dispute and said that the members of the Commission should be appreciative of the hard work that went into these efforts.

Executive Director Reddel returned the discussion to the issue of Eisenhower quotations, and observed that the members of the quotations committee had reached consensus on the use of one particular quotation from Eisenhower's Guildhall Address of 1945. Gen. Reddel stated that he knew of no one who opposed the use of this quotation, and he therefore suggested that the Commissioners might avail themselves of this opportunity to approve its use. Chairman Siciliano called for a vote on the use of the quotation from the Guildhall Address, and the Commission approved unanimously.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 p.m.

Attachment: Letter from Susan and Anne Eisenhower

Anne Eisenhower
790 Madison Ave.
New York, New York 10065

Susan Eisenhower
2801 New Mexico Ave. NW
Washington DC 20007

June 19, 2013

Dear Chairman Simpson,

Thank you in advance for reading this letter from members of the Eisenhower family to the Eisenhower Memorial Commissioners. We appreciate their consideration.

*

Dear Commissioners,

On behalf of our father John, Ike's son, and our brother, David, and sister, Mary, we thank you for your shared desire to see a memorial to Dwight Eisenhower in Washington DC. It's important that you know we respect and deeply appreciate the Commission's dedication to this goal.

In this difficult environment on public spending and reductions in crucial national programs, we believe that continuing to devote taxpayer money to the bitterly controversial design by Frank Gehry may threaten the very idea of a memorial to Dwight Eisenhower. We worry that significant additional taxpayer dollars will be wasted on trying to break this impasse.

We regret that the Commission has been at odds with our family on this issue, but we feel many of the problems have come from the staff. Since we are at a crucial stage in the memorial effort we urge you, as commissioners, to think beyond the current disagreements and put Ike's memory first. As you know, the Dwight D. Eisenhower Memorial Completion Act will, at some stage, be brought to the floor of the House of Representatives and you are now holding a commission meeting of great importance.

Revitalizing the process and "rebranding" the Eisenhower Memorial as a nationally unifying effort must be our goal now. There is still the public impetus to do it. But, continued insistence on this controversial plan could easily jeopardize our collective efforts. It would alienate Congress and drive potential donors away. Since the Eisenhower family will not support the current Gehry design, it could also impact the crucial requirement to raise private sector funds.

We ask that you join us in giving new life to the memorialization effort. By voting for an open competition to redesign the Eisenhower Memorial--an action that has ample historical precedent-- you will be giving the memorialization of Dwight D. Eisenhower a chance of success.

Respectfully yours,



Anne Eisenhower



Susan Eisenhower